

Memo

To: Ray Faucher
From: William Plumpton
Date: November 15, 2002
Re: Dismissal of Alternatives, I-395 / Route 9 Transportation Study

Our current range of alternatives consists of six alternatives and 10 modifications of alternatives for a total of 16 possibilities for satisfying the study purpose and needs. These alternatives and their modifications are:

- No-build Alternative
- Alternative 1-1, 1-2, 1-3, and 1-4
- Alternative 1-4B-1, 1-4B-2, 1-4B-3, and 1-4B-4
- Alternative 2B, 2B-1, and 2BE3K
- Alternative 3EIK, 3EIK-1, and 3A-3EIK-1
- Alternative 4B

After reviewing this range of alternatives in light of the other coordination since the last PAC meeting on September 18, we offer the following direction and rationale for reducing this range of alternatives:

Family of Alternative 4, 1-4B:

- Alternatives 4B, 1-4B-1, 1-4B-2, 1-4B-3, and 1-4B-4: Dismiss from further consideration.
 - For Alternative 4B, little overall public support. Only public support appears to be from the City of Brewer. Little to no public support from the Town of Holden.
 - Physically the most intrusive alternatives: Alternative 4B =7.92 million c.y. of earthwork, 1-4Bs=6.0 million c.y. of earthwork. Most expensive to construct; although detailed cost estimate has not been prepared, alternatives do not appear to be able to be constructed at an affordable cost.
 - Perception that Alternative 4B would result in substantial reduction in existing property values, eliminate future economic development on Route 1A, and result in an increase in taxes to offset reductions.
 - Potentially substantial operational impacts to Camp Roosevelt.
 - 1-4Bs result in many more residential displacements than other alternatives retained.

- In general, require approximately 50 more acres of land to construct than Alternative 1.
- 1-4Bs requires approximately 10 more acres of wetlands to construct than Alternative 1, therefore permitting will be a greater challenge.
- Less effective than other alternatives retained for further consideration at satisfying study purpose and needs (see traffic measures).

Conclusion: Do not retain an alternative or modification of an alternative from these families for further consideration. Other alternatives exist that are more effective at satisfying the purpose and needs of this study, with less overall adverse impact to people and the environment, at a lower cost.

Family of Alternative 1:

- Alternative 1-1: Dismiss from further consideration.
 - Does not satisfy study purpose of improved system linkage. The introduction of seven traffic signals, no matter how well coordinated, is contrary to a high-speed connection between the interstate and principal arterials envisioned. Additional concerns include increased local O & M costs with pacer lights and lack of driver understanding and acceptance.
 - Less effective than other alternatives retained for further consideration at satisfying study purpose and needs (see traffic measures).
 - 17 residential displacements – a large number compared to other alternatives retained.

- Alternative 1-4: Dismiss from further consideration.
 - More physically intrusive and greater displacement of people than Alternatives 1-2 and 1-3. Would further accentuate a perceived divide of the Town.
 - More disruptive to business community than Alternatives 1-2 and 1-3 as the c/d lanes would be very restrictive to accessing businesses.
 - Would be more restrictive and increase emergency response times.
 - Less effective than other alternatives retained for further consideration at satisfying study purpose and needs (see traffic measures).
 - 21 residential displacements – a large number compared to other alternatives retained.
 - Assumed to be more expensive to construct than Alternatives 1-2 and 1-3.

Conclusion: Retain either Alternatives 1-2 and 1-3. Look to Town of Holden and local business community to help identify one that they can support. No need to retain both for further consideration unless concurrence cannot be achieved. Recognize that both will limit access to residences and businesses, place (service) roads on both sides of residences and businesses, result in a visual intrusion along Route 1A with the creation of interchanges, increase emergency response and

deadhead time, and create approximately 4.9 or 6.2 miles of local roads to be owned and maintained by local community.

Family of Alternative 2:

- Alternative 2BE3K: Dismiss from further consideration.
 - Impacts approximately 54 acres of wetlands. Under Section 404, would not be the Least Environmentally Damaging Practicable Alternative and would not be permitted. Alternatives 2B and 2B-1 impact 28 and 35 acres of wetlands, respectively.

Conclusion: Retain Alternatives 2B and 2B-1 for further consideration. Seek advice from Town of Eddington on impacts to residents living along Route 9 for Alternative 2B versus approximately 100 more acres of land to build Alternative 2B-1. Ability to receive a permit from the Federal and state regulatory and resource agencies remains a question. Recognize that Alternative 2B is less effective at satisfying system linkage purpose and need than 2B-1.

Family of Alternative 3:

- Alternative 3EIK: Dismiss from further consideration.
 - No known public support from the Town of Holden.
 - Greater proximity impacts to people along Eastern Avenue than either Alternatives 3EIK-1 or 3A-3EIK-1.
 - Alternative 3EIK takes approximately 20 more acres of area to build than Alternative 3A-3EIK-1.
 - Approximately 30% (1,100 feet) more bridge length than either Alternatives 3EIK-1 or 3A-3EIK-1.
 - Less effective at satisfying traffic congestion need than either Alternatives 3EIK-1 or 3A-3EIK-1.

- Alternative 3EIK-1: Dismiss from further consideration.
 - Approximately one mile longer to build than Alternative 3A-3EIK-1. Alternative 3EIK-1 also takes approximately 20 more acres of area to build than Alternative 3A-3EIK-1.
 - Assuming retention and use of existing interchange, Alternative 3EIK-1 would create circuitous traffic movements to and from Route 1A.
 - Opposition from the Holden Business Association. Holden Business Association has indicated support for alternatives that connect to the existing I-395 Interchange such as Alternative 3A-3EIK-1.

Conclusion: Retain Alternative 3A-3EIK-1 for further consideration. Recognize that Alternative 3A-3EIK-1 results in six more displacements than Alternative 3EIK and four more displacements than 3EIK-1. Alternative 3A-3EIK-1 results in 7 acres more floodplain impact than 3EIK-1. Recognize Town of Holden views this family as not complying with their Comprehensive Plan.

Alternatives to be Retained for Further Consideration are:

- ❑ No-build Alternative
- ❑ Alternative 1-2 or 1-3
- ❑ Alternative 2B and 2B-1
- ❑ Alternative 3A-3EIK-1